

REFUGEE CAMPS AND GATED COMMUNITIES AS A SOLUTION FOR HOUSING

BÜŞRA ÖZAYDIN ÇAT

Dept of Architecture, Kocaeli University, Kocaeli, Turkey

Today the World has a biggest crisis of refugee since The World War II. Refugee is a person who is depressed due to his/her religion, race and ideas or who defect to another country with fear of being oppressed. The refugee camps are high intensity places which provide refugees housing and other social and physical needs. On the other hand today in the capitalist and global cities the most important places for housing are gated communities. The scope of this study is to examine the social and physical similarities of refugee camps and gated communities. Within this framework when we look at some definitions of the concept of gated community, we can see the imitation of refugee camp. In this study, firstly the concept of housing/dwelling and the concept of security which is the most important reason of emerging of gated communities and refugee camps will be analyzed. Then physical and social resemblances of gated communities and refugee camps will be examined. For identifying physical similarities being surrounded by wall or fence, location of the gated communities and refugee camps in the city, their outbuildings like market, pharmacy and their intensity will be analyzed. For social similarities the sense of belonging of refugees and residents and their relations with city will be examined. The results of these will be summarized and evaluated.

Keywords: Security, Intensity, Outbuildings, Sense of belonging.

1 GENERAL APPEARANCE

The largest refugee crisis since World War II is taking place in today's world. Most of the experts consider this era as a "refugee era". Refugee is someone who defected to another country because of persecution or fear of persecution in his home country due to religion, race, and membership of social groups or political thoughts. According to the last report published by The United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, about 60 million people across the world are forced to move away from their homes. While the number of displaced people was 37.5 million in 2003, in 2013, 51.2 million and in 2014 , 59.5 million (UNCHR 2016). The increase between 2014 and 2015 is the highest per one single year. The most important reason of this increase is the war and crisis in Syria. According to UNCHR, the number of displaced people in Syria is 4,597,436. Together with displaced people within the country, this value reaches to 7.6 million. Due to the close proximity to Syria, there are 2,503,549 registered Syrian people in Turkey (UNCHR 2016). Turkey has signed the Geneva Convention with a geographical limitation in 1951. Due to the number of asylum seekers/refugee, Turkey has an important place in this regard.

Refugee camp is the living space of people who are displaced from their homes as a result of political and social conflict according to the international refugee law. Refugee camps are established as a tent city or a container city across the world. Tan (2015), refugee camps in Turkey are investigated in two parts: One of them is official camps which are managed by AFAD and hosted people from Syria and Kobane. The other one is the empty spaces which are used as camps such as schools, bus terminals, indoor sport halls, factories or warehouses. In general, designed refugee camps are surrounded by barbed wire or wall. Refugee camps meet the requirements of education, health, hygiene and some social needs of the residents in addition to the requirement of shelter. Refugee camps, being are taking placed inside or outside a city, have different types of relationships with the city. Refugee camps, which are economic burden for the country, are mostly founded on narrow lands which causes increased of density. On the other hand, refugees can go outside of the camp only under certain circumstances. This situation causes limited interaction between refugees and the city.

Agamben (2002) describes camp concept as an exception. Tan (2015) said that, this exception status is seen in close sites, dissociated neighborhoods named as ghetto and urban renewal neighborhoods. Therefore, these parts of cities can be compared with the refugee camps. In this context, gated communities can be considered.

Gated communities are the public fields that customize as residential area and have controlled entrance (Blakely and Snyder 1997, Low 2003). According to Ozgur's definition (2006), gated communities are the residential areas which are formatted as a predefined life style and offer some recreational facilities. In this context, it can be said that gated communities cause a security-based kind of decomposition.

The most important definition, which is the starting point of this study, is that gated communities are the modern and desirable refugee camps (Diken 2004). Tan's (2015) definition for refugee camps is also valid for gated communities which is that a designed village, city or neighborhood in small land in order to meet the needs of a community. The housing need is in the center of these two types of construction. In this context, the scope of the study is to examine primarily the concept design of housing.

It is known that there is a danger of legitimate override about refugee camps by producing a discourse about them. However the aim of this study is not analyzing the legitimacy the refugee camps, but to question the constitutionalism of gated communities by comparing them with the refugee camps. On the other hand, the transformation of the concept of "refugee camp" should be kept in mind.

2 THE CONCEPT of HOUSING/DWELLING and SECURITY

The dictionary definition of housing has two important points,

- To take refuge in the closed area to protect from natural effect.
- To settle in somewhere that is suitable to live (TDK 2016).

To better understand we can use dwelling instead of housing. Housing/dwelling is a concept that defining the existence of person. It is all about the physical, social and psychological relations of people that people interact with space (Ersoy 2002). According to Ersoy (2002) tell from Saegert (1985) dwelling provides the most closed

relation between the people and environment or place. The act of protection that is in the dictionary definition of the housing derives from security need of person. So the concept of security that is effective on emerging refugee camps and gated communities should be analyzed.

Regarding the definition of the concept of refugee, it can be said that the most important reason of the refuging is unsecured conditions and environment that people live in and people who want to live in a safer place. In this context, it is possible to say that refugee camps are the places that make it possible to house the people have a risk of death. But on the other hand, this delicate space is not a free space.

Gated communities are the spaces that people want to live in to protect themselves from urban crimes and insecure environment based on urban crimes. Especially in big cities the spaces that have uncontrolled risk areas cause the people to tend to the low risk and protected spaces. But this secure area only made possible with monitoring. Çoban ve Özarlan, (2008) report that gated communities are the panoptic places that includes monitoring to be secure. So it can be said that like in refugee camps, people are not totally free in gated communities. Moreover, in gated communities people accept the monitoring voluntarily for the sake security. Refugee camps and gated communities have some physical and social similarities like reason of arising. So the concept of security that is effective on emerging refugee camps and gated communities should be analyzed.

3 PHYSICAL SIMILARITIES

3.1 Walls and the other Monitoring Means

Refugee camps are the spaces that are surrounded by a wall or fence, a restricted zone and having a watch tower for the providing security and prevent the escapes. But these spaces that emerge being surrounded by a wall or fence are not only limiting the movement of the refugees inside, but also border the other people living in the city. About this, Ömer Faruk Gönenç (2015) says that Israel creates a prison in its land by settle the Palestine camps. It can be said that the idea of enclosing by bordering comes from the concept of nation-state. On the other hand, there is a similar situation in the gated communities. Yönet (2011) reports that considerable numbers of the researchers define the gated communities as, separate worlds, isolated communities and social island. According to Landman (2000), protected placements are not only residence but also commercial and residential areas which are separated by walls or balustrades from their surroundings that have controlled entrances using doors and barriers. Even if these walls are built for the sake of security, they also represent one other thing. Luymes, (1997) say that the walls are the symbols of the power on economy and control. Also in both the refugee camps and gated communities, being surrounded by a wall or fence means to be separated from the public space and but the use instead of common field instead.

3.2 Location in the City

In general refugee camps are built away from the center of the city. This situation causes both some problems during both the construction process of the camp to provide infrastructure services, and the use as weakening the relations of refugee with the city

center. Also providing health, education and infrastructure services cause economic burden for the cities. However, there are some examples for refugee camps in the city center. For example, some refugee camps in Jordon are in the city center and they work as a part of the city. The relations between refugee camp in the center and city reduce of the effect of border. Like refugee camps, gated communities are built in the near vicinity of the city. This situation prevents the city's problems to affect the residents of the gated communities. On the other hand, to build these buildings in the far places, make them known. Luymes (1997) defined the gated communities by a developing form of the territorial control. Also it can be claimed that these are a form of privatization.

3.3 Outbuildings

In addition to the housing opportunity, refugee camps provide some outbuildings to refugees like personal hygiene spaces, sports areas, television rooms and mosques, places of education and health and market. They also include hairdressers, barbers and tailors. They both give job educations about this job and services to the refugee. But the outbuilding in the camps both provide some services to the refugees and legitimize the reality of the camps. The outbuildings are the indicators of the possibility of living in the camps conditions. Gönenç (2015) exemplify this with the refugee camps in the Palestine and report that people living in these camps don't want these outbuildings. On the other hand gated communities enable lots of activities in the area. Gated communities contain some services like; recreation and sports areas, green areas and walkways, cultural activity areas, swimming pools, parking, education, health and shopping center. Variety and quality of this change as regards to people who live and use these places (Yönet 2011). Also these outbuildings that provide people some social and cultural opportunities are generally used as a marketing instrument.

3.4 Intensity

Even if legally designed refugee camps are built as regards to the estimated number of people, the increase in the number of refugees causes intensity in the camps rise. For example, although Zaatari refugee camps in Jordon have only 60.000 people capacity, according to the last data of UNCHR, 79.457 live in this camp (UNCHR 2016). We can give another example for the intensity of the camps from Turkey. Suleymansah Accommodation Area is in the Akcakale, Sanliurfa. Although population of Akcakale is 27.000, the number of the refugees in the Suleymansah Accommodation Area is nearly 35.000. When we look at the intensity of the gated communities we can see the same situation. For gated communities the concept of intensity can be analyzed under the two titles. One of them is higher land price in big cities. It causes more people to live in a smaller area. The other one is changing master plans within the scope of urban transformations. To build the high rises instead of the low rises in the same area cause the intensity to increase.

4 SOCIAL SIMILARITIES

4.1 Refugees and Resident's Relations with the City

For people living in the refugee camps, it is difficult to form a relationship with the city because of both their political status and border of the camps. The effects of this problematical relation increase in refugee camps that are far away from center of the city. So, for a considerable number of people that live in the camps, the city is no longer a part of land. But there are some exceptions. For instance, Amman New Camp (Wihdat) is in the center of the capital Amman in Jordan. The camp is the representative and leader of the social life by producing the actor of the daily and social life (Gönenç 2015). On the other hand, the relation of people who live in the gated communities with the city is similar to the refugees. There are two reasons for this problematic relation. One of them is walls that surround the gated communities and the other one is outbuildings in the area. There is no need for residents to get out, because all of the things that they need are in the area. They don't contact the other part of the cities. They even interact with nature to the extent permitted by security staff or wall (Hook and Vrdoljak 2002). In gated communities there are inside and outside areas. But in camp the area is not inside or outside. It describes third area (Gönenç 2015).

4.2 Sense of Belonging

It is possible to say that people living in refugee camps cannot contact the city, so they don't have a sense of belonging to the area. On the other hand, the housing spaces in the camps are the same; none of them are special for anyone. So people cannot relate personally or profoundly. The weakness of the sense of belonging of people living in gated communities can be estimated to be a result of the metropolis. Metropolitan person have belonging problem (Simmel 2003). Gated communities are suitable for the metropolitan person. People don't feel themselves belong to the city or space they live in. They feel themselves belong to images that are produced by space or city.

5 CONCLUSION

In this study the social and physical similarities of refugee camps and gated communities was examined. Firstly the concept of housing/dwelling and the concept of security which are the most important reasons of emerging of gated communities and refugee camps were analyzed. Then physical and social resemblances of gated communities and refugee camps were examined. For physical similarity it was analyzed that being surrounded by wall or fence, the location of the gated communities and refugee camps in the city, their outbuildings and their intensity. The sense of belonging of refugees and residents and their relations with city was examined to be the social similarities.

In this context it was determined that there are some similarities between refugee camps and gated communities. In this sense, it can be claimed that people living in the gated communities are the refugees of the metropolis. On the other hand, it was determined that refugee camps have a sense changing in the framework of their existence. This change requires estimating the camps in a new context. So a new

terminology is needed. The concept of camp-villes that are produced by Agier (2002) can be estimated as a part of the new terminology.

References

- Agamben, G., *Kutsal İnsan - Egemen İktidar ve Çıplak Hayat*, trans.: İsmail Türkmen, Ayrıntı, 226-227, 2002.
- Agier, M., "Between War and City: Towards an Urban Anthropology of Refugee Camps", *Ethnography*, 3, 322. 2002.
- Blakely, E. J., Snyder, M. G., *Fortress America: Gated Communities in the United States*, Washington DC and Cambridge, MA: Brookings Institution Press and Lincoln Institute of Land Policy, 1997.
- Çoban, B., Özarslan, Z., *Panoptikon: Gözün İktidarı*, Su Yayınevi: İstanbul, 2008.
- Ersoy, A., Z., *Konut ve Ev Kavramlarının Karsılaştırılması Analizi*, Unpublished PHD Thesis, Dokuz Eylül University, 2002.
- Diken, B., *From Refugee Camps to Gated Communities: Biopolitics and the End of the City*, *Citizenship Studies*, 8, 1, 3-106, 2004.
- Gönenç, Ö., F., *Kamp/Mülteci: Çatışma Mekanlarında Sömürsüzleştirme Mimarlığı, Kentlilik ve Eve Dönüş: Batı Şeria Mülteci Kampları*, *Arredamento Mimarlık, Boyut*, 3, 68-76, March, 2015. (2015)
- Hook, D., Vrdoljak, M., *Gated Communities, Heterotopia and a "Rights" of Privilege: a "Heterotopology" of the South African Security-Park*, *Geoforum*, 33, 195-219, 2002.
- Landman, K., *Gated Communities and Urban Sustainability: Taking a Closer Look at the Future*, 2nd Southern African Conference on Sustainable Development in the Built Environment (Strategies for a Sustainable Built Environment), Pretoria, South Africa, 2000.
- Low, S., *Behind the Gates: Life, Security and the Pursuit of Happiness in Fortress America*, New York: Routledge, 2003.
- Luymes, D., *The Fortification of Suburbia: Investigating the Rise of Enclave Communities*, *Landscape and Urban Planning*, 39, 187-203, 1997.
- Özgür, F. E., *Sosyal ve Mekansal Ayrısma Çerçevesinde Yeni Konutlaşma Eğilimleri: Kapalı Siteler, İstanbul, Çekmeköy Örneği*, *Planlama Dergisi*, 4, 79-95, 2006.
- Saegert, S., *Home Environment*. In I. Altman & C. Werner (Eds), *The Role of Housing in the Experience of Dwelling*, 1985.
- Simmel, G., *Modern Kültürde Catisma*, trans. Gen, E., Kalayci, N., Bora, T., İletişim Yayınları, İstanbul, 2003
- Tan P., *Kamp/Mülteci: Çatışma Mekanlarında Sömürsüzleştirme Mimarlığı, Müşterekleşme Pratiği Olarak Mülteci Kampı*, *Arredamento Mimarlık, Boyut*, 3, 77-84, March, 2015.
- TDK retrieved from <http://tdk.gov.tr> on January, 2016.
- UNCHR retrieved from <http://www.unhcr.org/turkey/home.php?content=640> on January, 2016.
- UNCHR retrieved from <http://data.unhcr.org/syrianrefugees/regional.php> on January, 2016.
- UNCHR retrieved from <http://data.unhcr.org/syrianrefugees/region.php?id=77&country=107> on January, 2016.
- Yönet., A.,N., *Korumalı Yerleşimlerin Tercih Sebeplerinde Etkili Olan Faktörleri Açıklamaya Yönelik Kavramsal Bir Model*, Unpublished PHD Thesis, Istanbul Technical University, 2011.